

USC Annenberg

Center on Communication
Leadership & Policy

Research Series on Technology and Human Trafficking

The Rise of Mobile and the Diffusion of Technology-Facilitated Trafficking

Mark Latonero, Ph.D.

Principal Investigator, Research Director

Research Team

Jennifer Musto, Ph.D., *Co-Investigator*

Zhaleh Boyd, *Research Manager*

Ev Boyle, *Global Research Fellow*

Amber Bissel, Kari Gibson, and Joanne Kim, *Law Student Fellows*

November 2012



USC University of
Southern California

About the Authors



Mark Latonero (latonero@usc.edu) is research director and deputy managing director at the Annenberg Center on Communication Leadership & Policy and a research assistant professor at the University of Southern California. His research examines emerging communication technology and social change with a focus on the intersection of technology, human rights, and human trafficking. Latonero has been appointed to a National Academy of Science/Institute of Medicine committee to study domestic minor sex trafficking and is a member of the California Attorney General's working group on human trafficking. He has published in journals such as *Information, Communication & Society*, *International Journal of Information Systems for Crisis Response and Management*, and *Communication Research*. Latonero completed his Ph.D. at the USC Annenberg School for Communication and Journalism and was a postdoctoral research scholar at the London School of Economics. He is a member of the Pacific Council on International Policy.

Jennifer Musto is an external faculty fellow at Rice University Humanities Research Center's Seminar on Human Trafficking. Recently, Musto was a postdoctoral research fellow at the USC Annenberg Center on Communication Leadership & Policy and was awarded a Microsoft Research grant for technology and human trafficking research. Musto has held joint institutional appointments as visiting lecturer in women's and gender studies at Wellesley College and visiting scholar in women's, gender, and sexuality studies at Northeastern University. Dr. Musto completed her Ph.D. at UCLA's Department of Gender Studies.

Zhaleh Boyd was Technology & Trafficking in Persons research fellow at the USC Annenberg Center on Communication Leadership & Policy while earning her master's in public diplomacy at USC. She is currently pursuing a Ph.D. at the Wiberforce Institute for the study of slavery and emancipation at the University of Hull in the United Kingdom.

Ev Boyle is a global research fellow at the USC Annenberg Center on Communication Leadership & Policy. He holds a B.A. in communications from the University of Pennsylvania and an MSc in Global Media and Communications from the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Amber Bissell is a student at Loyola Law School and also works for the Los Angeles City Attorney as a research assistant on juvenile justice issues. Amber received her MSc in Gender and Social Policy from the London School of Economics where she focused on trafficking as well as healthcare, immigration, and other social issues.

Joanne Kim is a third-year law student at the University of Washington. She received her B.A. in Communication from the USC Annenberg School for Communication and Journalism.

Kari Gibson is a third-year student at USC's Gould School of Law. She received her B.A. from the USC School of Cinematic Arts and her M.A. in applied linguistics from the University of Hawaii at Manoa.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We would like to thank the following reviewers for sharing their time and expertise: Genet Berhane, Acumen Fund; danah boyd, Microsoft Research; Kirsten Foot, University of Washington; Erin Kamler, USC Annenberg; Jack Lerner, USC Gould School of Law; Anthony Talbott, University of Dayton; Matali Thakor, MIT; Yasmin Vafa, Rights4Girls; and John Vanek, retired lieutenant, San Jose Police Department.

Our dedicated project team at the USC Annenberg Center on Communication Leadership & Policy includes Sarah Ledesma, Megan O'Neil, and Bridgette Bugay. Stefanie Demetriades was instrumental in drafting sections of the report. Isaac Rottman, Susan Goelz, and the rest of the CCLP team provided key assistance to the project. Thanks also to the CCLP Board and Senior Fellows, especially Clothilde Hewlett and Jeremy Curtin, for their indispensable guidance and support. Geoffrey Cowan and Geoffrey Baum provided the leadership for this project.

A number of individuals and groups also provided insights for this research including Eduard Hovy and Andrew Philpot at USC Information Sciences Institute, USC Annenberg School for Communication and Journalism, USC Viterbi School of Engineering, USC Office of Research, Trevor Steele and Jeff Monford, Rane Johnson at Microsoft Research, Samantha Doerr and the team at Microsoft Digital Crimes Unit, Ernie Allen at the International Center on Missing and Exploited Children, the U.S. Department of State, Office of the California Attorney General, the LA Metro Task Force on Human Trafficking, the White House Office on Women and Girls, Office of the U.S. Chief Technology Officer, Google, and Palantir Technologies.

We would also like to thank the law enforcement officers and agents who agreed to be interviewed for this report. Thanks to our photographer Jeff Antebi and to the Los Angeles Police Department for extending their hospitality to him during his field observations.

The content of this report represents the research conducted by the authors and does not necessarily reflect the perspectives of any individual or group acknowledged above.



For more information about
Human Trafficking Online,
visit <http://technologyandtrafficking.usc.edu>



Human Trafficking Online is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License. This work can be freely shared and quoted with attribution to the authors and for non-commercial purposes.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

“We are turning the tables on the traffickers. Just as they are now using technology and the Internet to exploit their victims, we are going to harness technology to stop them.”

—*President Barack Obama*
Address to the Clinton Global Initiative
September 25, 2012

In September 2012, President Obama identified human trafficking as one of the great human rights issues of our time, representing a “debasement of our common humanity that tears at the social fabric of our communities, endangers public health, distorts markets, and fuels violence and organized crime.”ⁱ The nature and extent of human trafficking in modern society is complex and evolving, however, and our understanding of the phenomenon is fraught with contested terminologies and differing perceptions. Broadly speaking, human trafficking involves the severe sexual and labor exploitation of vulnerable people for financial gain, which amounts to a gross violation of human rights. Children exploited in the sex trade are especially at risk. What role does technology play in the shifting dynamics of human trafficking today?

In this report, researchers at the USC Annenberg Center on Communication Leadership & Policy (CCLP) reveal how those involved in human trafficking have been quick to adapt to the 21st-century global landscape. While the rapid diffusion of digital technologies such as mobile phones, social networking sites, and the Internet has provided significant benefits to society, new channels and opportunities for exploitation have also emerged. Increasingly, the business of human trafficking is taking place online and over mobile phones. But the same technologies that are being used for trafficking can become a powerful tool to combat trafficking. The precise role that

digital technologies play in human trafficking still remains unclear, however, and a closer examination of the phenomenon is vital to identify and respond to new threats and opportunities.

This investigation indicates that mobile devices and networks have risen in prominence and are now of central importance to the sex trafficking of minors in the United States. While online platforms such as online classifieds and social networking sites remain a potential venue for exploitation, this research suggests that technology-facilitated trafficking is more diffuse and adaptive than initially thought. This report presents a review of current literature, trends, and policies; primary research based on mobile phone data collected from online classified sites; a series of firsthand interviews with law enforcement; and key recommendations to policymakers and stakeholders moving forward.

While the sex trafficking of minors continues to expand across multiple media platforms, our research indicates that the rise of mobile technology may fundamentally transform the trafficking landscape. No other communication technology in history, including the Internet, has been adopted so rapidly around the world.ⁱⁱ The World Bank estimates that 75% of the global population has access to a mobile phone.ⁱⁱⁱ Mobile’s ability to facilitate real-time communication and coordination, unbound by physical location, is also being exploited by traffickers to extend the reach of their illicit activities. Traffickers are able to recruit, advertise, organize, and communicate primarily—or even exclusively—via mobile phone, effectively streamlining their activities and expanding their criminal networks. In short, human traffickers and criminal networks are taking advantage of technology to reach larger audiences and to do illicit business more quickly and efficiently across greater distances.

Mobile communication may also represent a

The rise of mobile has major implications both for the spread of human trafficking and for anti-trafficking efforts, and should be carefully considered by law enforcement, policymakers, and activists as they develop strategies to combat human trafficking.

breakthrough for interventions by law enforcement and the anti-trafficking community. Data gleaned from cellphones and mobile networks constitute a trail of information and evidence that can be a powerful tool in identifying, tracking, and prosecuting traffickers. Mobile technologies can also be used to reach vulnerable communities and raise public awareness. The rise of mobile has major implications both for the spread of human trafficking and for anti-trafficking efforts, and should be carefully considered by law enforcement, policymakers, and activists as they develop strategies to combat human trafficking in the United States and worldwide. Furthermore, the respect for privacy and civil liberties, and potential unintended consequences of technological interventions on victims and survivors, are crucial considerations in developing mobile-based solutions.

This research expands on CCLP's 2011 report examining the role of online technologies in human trafficking. Key findings of the 2011 report focused on the use of Internet technologies, particularly online classifieds and social media sites, for the sex trafficking of minors in the United States. The USC Information Sciences Institute (ISI) and CCLP collaborated

to develop prototype software designed to detect possible cases of sex trafficking of minors online. Our research indicated that tools such as data mining, mapping, computational linguistics, and advanced analytics could be used by governmental and nongovernmental organizations, law enforcement, academia, and the private sector to further anti-trafficking goals of prevention, protection, and prosecution.

The CCLP Technology & Trafficking Initiative was launched in June 2010 in coordination with Alec Ross, Secretary of State Hillary Clinton's senior adviser for innovation, and Ambassador Luis CdeBaca, head of the State Department's Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons. Both Ross and CdeBaca have stressed the need for increased information and understanding of the role of technology in trafficking. International fieldwork conducted by the CCLP research team in Cambodia, Haiti, Saudi Arabia, Thailand, and Vietnam has provided further evidence of the potential to harness information technology for counter-trafficking efforts.

Domestically, CCLP has convened a series of meetings with U.S. leaders from law enforcement, government, private technology firms, nongovernmental organizations, and academia to explore the online trafficking landscape. For example, in November 2011, CCLP and California Attorney General Kamala Harris' office co-hosted a multi-sector meeting to develop partnerships and policy recommendations around technology and trafficking issues. Since the launch of CCLP's Technology & Trafficking Initiative in 2010, there has been commendable progress in increasing attention to and understanding of technology's role in trafficking across sectors. However, many questions remain unanswered, and continued evidence-based research is required to fully comprehend the problem and design pragmatic, effective solutions.

The growing awareness of technology's central role in human trafficking is an important step forward, but technological development is prone to constant and rapid evolution. In order to keep pace with the ongoing transformation of the trafficking landscape, counter-trafficking responses will need to maintain constant vigilance and adopt mobile technology as a central tool within a comprehensive strategy. Looking ahead to President Obama's second term in office, we urge the White House to build on his commitment to "turn the tables" on traffickers, and continue to be a leader in innovative solutions.

As human trafficking, and many of today's most pressing social issues, become increasingly mediated by technologies, the negative and positive dimensions of technology's impact on social change and human rights must become vital considerations.